

Network Working Group
Request for Comments: 4644
Updates: 2980
Category: Standards Track

J. Vinocur
Cornell University
K. Murchison
Carnegie Mellon University
October 2006

Network News Transfer Protocol (NNTP) Extension for Streaming Feeds

Status of This Memo

This document specifies an Internet standards track protocol for the Internet community, and requests discussion and suggestions for improvements. Please refer to the current edition of the "Internet Official Protocol Standards" (STD 1) for the standardization state and status of this protocol. Distribution of this memo is unlimited.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2006).

Abstract

This memo defines an extension to the Network News Transfer Protocol (NNTP) to provide asynchronous (otherwise known as "streaming") transfer of articles. This allows servers to transfer articles to other servers with much greater efficiency.

This document updates and formalizes the CHECK and TAKETHIS commands specified in RFC 2980 and deprecates the MODE STREAM command.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	2
1.1. Conventions Used in this Document	2
2. The STREAMING Extension	3
2.1. Streaming Article Transfer	3
2.2. Advertising the STREAMING Extension	4
2.3. MODE STREAM Command	5
2.3.1. Usage	5
2.3.2. Description	5
2.3.3. Examples	5
2.4. CHECK Command	6
2.4.1. Usage	6
2.4.2. Description	6
2.4.3. Examples	6
2.5. TAKETHIS Command	7

2.5.1. Usage	7
2.5.2. Description	7
2.5.3. Examples	8
3. Augmented BNF Syntax for the STREAMING Extension	9
3.1. Commands	9
3.2. Command Datastream	9
3.3. Responses	10
3.4. Capability Entries	10
4. Summary of Response Codes	10
5. Security Considerations	11
6. IANA Considerations	11
7. Acknowledgements	12
8. References	12
8.1. Normative References	12
8.2. Informative References	12

1. Introduction

According to the NNTP specification [NNTP], a peer uses the IHAVE command to query whether a server wants a particular article. Because the IHAVE command cannot be pipelined, the need to stop and wait for the remote end's response greatly restricts the throughput that can be achieved.

The ad-hoc CHECK and TAKETHIS commands, originally documented in [NNTP-COMMON], provide an alternative method of peer-to-peer article transfer that permits a more effective use of network bandwidth. Due to their proven usefulness and wide deployment, they are formalized in this specification.

The ad-hoc MODE STREAM command, also documented in [NNTP-COMMON], is deprecated by this specification, but due to its ubiquity is documented here for backwards compatibility.

1.1. Conventions Used in this Document

The notational conventions used in this document are the same as those in [NNTP] and any term not defined in this document has the same meaning as in that one.

The key words "REQUIRED", "MUST", "MUST NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels" [KEYWORDS].

This document assumes your familiarity with NNTP [NNTP]. In general, the connections described below are from one peer to another, but we will continue to use "client" to mean the initiator of the NNTP connection, and "server" to mean the other endpoint.

In the examples, commands from the client are indicated with [C], and responses from the server are indicated with [S].

2. The STREAMING Extension

This extension provides three new commands: MODE STREAM, CHECK, and TAKETHIS. The capability label for this extension is STREAMING.

2.1. Streaming Article Transfer

The STREAMING extension provides the same functionality as the IHAVE command ([NNTP] section 6.3.2) but splits the query and transfer functionality into the CHECK and TAKETHIS commands respectively. This allows the CHECK and TAKETHIS commands to be pipelined ([NNTP] section 3.5) and provides for "streaming" article transfer.

A streaming client will often pipeline many CHECK commands and use the responses to construct a list of articles to be sent by a pipelined sequence of TAKETHIS commands, thus increasing the fraction of time spent transferring articles. The CHECK and TAKETHIS commands utilize distinct response codes so that these commands can be intermingled in a pipeline and the response to any single command can be definitively identified by the client.

The client MAY send articles via TAKETHIS without first querying the server with CHECK. The client SHOULD NOT send every article in this fashion unless explicitly configured to do so by the site administrator based on out-of-band information. However, the client MAY use an adaptive strategy where it initially sends CHECK commands for all articles, but switches to using TAKETHIS without CHECK if most articles are being accepted (over 95% acceptance might be a reasonable metric in some configurations). If the client uses such a strategy, it SHOULD also switch back to using CHECK on all articles if the acceptance rate ever falls much below the threshold.

2.2. Advertising the STREAMING Extension

A server supporting the streaming commands described in this document will advertise the "STREAMING" capability label in response to the CAPABILITIES command ([NNTP] section 5.2). The server MUST continue to advertise this capability after a client has issued the MODE STREAM command. This capability MAY be advertised both before and after any use of the MODE READER command ([NNTP] section 5.3), with the same semantics.

Example of a client using CAPABILITIES and MODE STREAM on a mode-switching server:

```
[C] CAPABILITIES
[S] 101 Capability list:
[S] VERSION 2
[S] MODE-READER
[S] IHAVE
[S] LIST ACTIVE
[S] STREAMING
[S] .
[C] MODE STREAM
[S] 203 Streaming permitted
[C] CAPABILITIES
[S] 101 Capability list:
[S] VERSION 2
[S] MODE-READER
[S] IHAVE
[S] LIST ACTIVE
[S] STREAMING
[S] .
[C] MODE READER
[S] 200 Posting allowed
[C] CAPABILITIES
[S] 101 Capability list:
[S] VERSION 2
[S] READER
[S] POST
[S] LIST ACTIVE NEWSGROUPS HEADERS
[S] HDR
[S] .
```

2.3. MODE STREAM Command

Historically this command was used by a client to discover if a server supported the CHECK and TAKETHIS commands. This command is deprecated in favor of the CAPABILITIES discovery command and is only provided here for compatibility with legacy implementations [NNTP-COMMON] of these transport commands.

New clients SHOULD use the CAPABILITIES command to check a server for support of the STREAMING extension but MAY use the MODE STREAM command for backwards compatibility with legacy servers that don't support the CAPABILITIES discovery command. Servers MUST accept the MODE STREAM command for backwards compatibility with legacy clients that don't use the CAPABILITIES discovery command.

NOTE: This command may be removed from a future version of this specification, therefore clients are urged to transition to the CAPABILITIES command wherever possible.

2.3.1. Usage

Syntax

MODE STREAM

Responses

203 Streaming permitted

2.3.2. Description

If a server supports this extension, it MUST return a 203 response to the MODE STREAM command (or 501 if an argument is given). The MODE STREAM command MUST NOT affect the server state in any way (that is, it is not a mode change despite the name), therefore this command MAY be pipelined. A server MUST NOT require that the MODE STREAM command be issued by the client before accepting the CHECK or TAKETHIS commands.

2.3.3. Examples

Example of a client checking the ability to stream articles on a server which does not support this extension:

```
[C] MODE STREAM
[S] 501 Unknown MODE variant
```

Example of a client checking the ability to stream articles on a server which supports this extension:

```
[C] MODE STREAM
[S] 203 Streaming permitted
```

2.4. CHECK Command

2.4.1. Usage

Syntax
CHECK message-id

Responses

```
238 message-id    Send article to be transferred
431 message-id    Transfer not possible; try again later
438 message-id    Article not wanted
```

Parameters

message-id = Article message-id

The first parameter of the 238, 431, and 438 responses MUST be the message-id provided by the client as the parameter to CHECK.

2.4.2. Description

The CHECK command informs the server that the client has an article with the specified message-id. If the server desires a copy of that article, a 238 response MUST be returned, indicating that the client may send the article using the TAKETHIS command. If the server does not want the article (if, for example, the server already has a copy of it), a 438 response MUST be returned, indicating that the article is not wanted. Finally, if the article isn't wanted immediately but the client should retry later if possible (if, for example, another client has offered to send the same article to the server), a 431 response MUST be returned.

NOTE: The responses to CHECK are advisory; the server MUST NOT rely on the client to behave as requested by these responses.

2.4.3. Examples

Example of a client checking whether the server would like a set of articles and getting a mixture of responses:

```
[C] CHECK <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>
[S] 238 <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>
[C] CHECK <i.am.an.article.you.have@example.com>
[S] 438 <i.am.an.article.you.have@example.com>
[C] CHECK <i.am.an.article.you.defer@example.com>
[S] 431 <i.am.an.article.you.defer@example.com>
```

Example of pipelining the CHECK commands in the previous example:

```
[C] CHECK <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>
[C] CHECK <i.am.an.article.you.have@example.com>
[C] CHECK <i.am.an.article.you.defer@example.com>
[S] 238 <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>
[S] 438 <i.am.an.article.you.have@example.com>
[S] 431 <i.am.an.article.you.defer@example.com>
```

2.5. TAKETHIS Command

2.5.1. Usage

A client MUST NOT use this command unless the server advertises the STREAMING capability or returns a 203 response to the MODE STREAM command.

Syntax

TAKETHIS message-id

Responses

```
239 message-id  Article transferred OK
439 message-id  Transfer rejected; do not retry
```

Parameters

message-id = Article message-id

The first parameter of the 239 and 439 responses MUST be the message-id provided by the client as the parameter to TAKETHIS.

2.5.2. Description

The TAKETHIS command is used to send an article with the specified message-id to the server. The article is sent immediately following the CRLF at the end of the TAKETHIS command line. The client MUST send the entire article, including headers and body, to the server as a multi-line data block ([NNTP] section 3.1.1). Thus, a single dot (".") on a line indicates the end of the text, and lines starting with a dot in the original text have that dot doubled during transmission. The server MUST return either a 239 response, indicating that the article was successfully transferred, or a 439 response, indicating that the article was rejected. If the server encounters a temporary error that prevents it from processing the article but does not want to reject the article, it MUST reply with a 400 response to the client and close the connection.

This function differs from the POST command in that it is intended for use in transferring already-posted articles between hosts. It

SHOULD NOT be used when the client is a personal news-reading program, since use of this command indicates that the article has already been posted at another site and is simply being forwarded from another host. However, despite this, the server MAY elect not to post or forward the article if, after further examination of the article, it deems it inappropriate to do so. Reasons for such subsequent rejection of an article may include problems such as inappropriate newsgroups or distributions, disk space limitations, article lengths, garbled headers, and the like. These are typically restrictions enforced by the server host's news software and not necessarily by the NNTP server itself.

The client SHOULD NOT assume that the article has been successfully transferred unless it receives an affirmative response from the server. A lack of response (such as a dropped network connection or a network timeout) or a 400 response SHOULD be treated as a temporary failure and cause the transfer to be tried again later if possible.

Because some news server software may not immediately be able to determine whether an article is suitable for posting or forwarding, an NNTP server MAY acknowledge the successful transfer of the article (with a 239 response) but later silently discard it.

2.5.3. Examples

Example of streaming two articles to another site (the first article is accepted and the second is rejected):

```
[C] TAKETHIS <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>
[C] Path: pathost!demo!somewhere!not-for-mail
[C] From: "Demo User" <nobody@example.com>
[C] Newsgroups: misc.test
[C] Subject: I am just a test article
[C] Date: 6 Oct 1998 04:38:40 -0500
[C] Organization: An Example Com, San Jose, CA
[C] Message-ID: <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>
[C]
[C] This is just a test article.
[C] .
[C] TAKETHIS <i.am.an.article.you.have@example.com>
[C] Path: pathost!demo!somewhere!not-for-mail
[C] From: "Demo User" <nobody@example.com>
[C] Newsgroups: misc.test
[C] Subject: I am just a test article
[C] Date: 6 Oct 1998 04:38:40 -0500
[C] Organization: An Example Com, San Jose, CA
[C] Message-ID: <i.am.an.article.you.have@example.com>
[C]
```



```
[C] This is just a test article.  
[C] .  
[S] 239 <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>  
[S] 439 <i.am.an.article.you.have@example.com>
```

Example of sending an article to a site where the transfer fails:

```
[C] TAKETHIS <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>  
[C] Path: pathost!demo!somewhere!not-for-mail  
[C] From: "Demo User" <nobody@example.com>  
[C] Newsgroups: misc.test  
[C] Subject: I am just a test article  
[C] Date: 6 Oct 1998 04:38:40 -0500  
[C] Organization: An Example Com, San Jose, CA  
[C] Message-ID: <i.am.an.article.you.will.want@example.com>  
[C]  
[C] This is just a test article.  
[C] .  
[S] 400 Service temporarily unavailable  
[Server closes connection.]
```

3. Augmented BNF Syntax for the STREAMING Extension

This section describes the formal syntax of the STREAMING extension using ABNF [ABNF]. It extends the syntax in section 9 of [NNTP], and non-terminals not defined in this document are defined there. The [NNTP] ABNF should be imported first before attempting to validate these rules.

3.1. Commands

This syntax extends the non-terminal "command", which represents an NNTP command.

```
command =/ check-command /  
          mode-stream-command /  
          takethis-command  
  
check-command      = "CHECK" WS message-id  
mode-stream-command = "MODE" WS "STREAM"  
takethis-command   = "TAKETHIS" WS message-id
```

3.2. Command Datastream

This syntax extends the non-terminal "command-datastream", which represents the further material sent by the client in the case of streaming commands.

```
command-datastream =/ takethis-datastream
```

```
takethis-datastream = encoded-article
```

3.3. Responses

This syntax extends the non-terminal "initial-response-content", which represents an initial response line sent by the server.

```
initial-response-content =/ response-238-content /  
    response-239-content /  
    response-431-content /  
    response-438-content /  
    response-439-content
```

```
response-238-content = "238" SP message-id  
response-239-content = "239" SP message-id  
response-431-content = "431" SP message-id  
response-438-content = "438" SP message-id  
response-439-content = "439" SP message-id
```

3.4. Capability Entries

This syntax extends the non-terminal "capability-entry", which represents a capability that may be advertised by the server.

```
capability-entry =/ streaming-capability  
  
streaming-capability = "STREAMING"
```

4. Summary of Response Codes

This section contains a list of each new response code defined in this document and indicates whether it is multi-line, which commands can generate it, what arguments it has, and what its meaning is.

Response code 203

Generated by: MODE STREAM
Meaning: streaming permitted.

Response code 238

Generated by: CHECK
1 argument: message-id
Meaning: send article to be transferred.

Response code 239

Generated by: TAKETHIS
1 argument: message-id
Meaning: article transferred OK.

Response code 431

Generated by: CHECK
1 argument: message-id
Meaning: transfer not possible; try again later.

Response code 438

Generated by: CHECK
1 argument: message-id
Meaning: article not wanted.

Response code 439

Generated by: TAKETHIS
1 argument: message-id
Meaning: transfer rejected; do not retry.

5. Security Considerations

No new security considerations are introduced by this extension, beyond those already described in the core specification [NNTP].

6. IANA Considerations

This section gives a formal definition of the STREAMING extension as required by Section 3.3.3 of [NNTP] for the IANA registry.

- o The STREAMING extension provides for streaming transfer of articles.
- o The capability label for this extension is "STREAMING".
- o The capability label has no arguments.
- o The extension defines three new commands, MODE STREAM, CHECK, and TAKETHIS, whose behavior, arguments, and responses are defined in Sections 2.3, 2.4, and 2.5 respectively.
- o The extension does not associate any new responses with pre-existing NNTP commands.
- o The extension does not affect the behavior of a server or client other than via the new commands.

- o The extension does not affect the maximum length of commands or initial response lines.
- o The extension does not alter pipelining, and the MODE STREAM, CHECK, and TAKETHIS commands can be pipelined.
- o Use of this extension does not alter the capabilities list.
- o The extension does not cause any pre-existing command to produce a 401, 480, or 483 response.
- o Use of the MODE READER command on a mode-switching server may disable this extension.
- o Published Specification: This document.
- o Contact for Further Information: Authors of this document.
- o Change Controller: IESG <iesg@ietf.org>.

7. Acknowledgements

This document is based heavily on the relevant sections of RFC 2980 [NNTP-COMMON], by Stan Barber.

Special acknowledgement also goes to Russ Allbery, Clive Feather, Andrew Gierth, and others who commented privately on intermediate revisions of this document, as well as the members of the IETF NNTP Working Group for continual (yet sporadic) insight in discussion.

8. References

8.1. Normative References

- | | |
|------------|---|
| [ABNF] | Crocker, D., Ed. and P. Overell, "Augmented BNF for Syntax Specifications: ABNF", RFC 4234, October 2005. |
| [KEYWORDS] | Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119, March 1997. |
| [NNTP] | Feather, C., "Network News Transfer Protocol (NNTP)", RFC 3977, October 2006. |

8.2. Informative References

- | | |
|---------------|---|
| [NNTP-COMMON] | Barber, S., "Common NNTP Extensions", RFC 2980, October 2000. |
|---------------|---|

Authors' Addresses

Jeffrey M. Vinocur
Department of Computer Science
Upson Hall
Cornell University
Ithaca, NY 14853

EMail: vinocur@cs.cornell.edu

Kenneth Murchison
Carnegie Mellon University
5000 Forbes Avenue
Cyert Hall 285
Pittsburgh, PA 15213 USA

EMail: murch@andrew.cmu.edu

Full Copyright Statement

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2006).

This document is subject to the rights, licenses and restrictions contained in BCP 78, and except as set forth therein, the authors retain all their rights.

This document and the information contained herein are provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE CONTRIBUTOR, THE ORGANIZATION HE/SHE REPRESENTS OR IS SPONSORED BY (IF ANY), THE INTERNET SOCIETY AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIM ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

Intellectual Property

The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any Intellectual Property Rights or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; nor does it represent that it has made any independent effort to identify any such rights. Information on the procedures with respect to rights in RFC documents can be found in BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Copies of IPR disclosures made to the IETF Secretariat and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementers or users of this specification can be obtained from the IETF on-line IPR repository at <http://www.ietf.org/ipr>.

The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights that may cover technology that may be required to implement this standard. Please address the information to the IETF at ietf-ipr@ietf.org.

Acknowledgement

Funding for the RFC Editor function is provided by the IETF Administrative Support Activity (IASA).

