Network Working Group Request for Comments: 3055 Category: Standards Track

M. Krishnaswamy Photuris, Inc. D. Romascanu Avaya Communication February 2001

Management Information Base for the PINT Services Architecture

Status of this Memo

This document specifies an Internet standards track protocol for the Internet community, and requests discussion and suggestions for improvements. Please refer to the current edition of the "Internet Official Protocol Standards" (STD 1) for the standardization state and status of this protocol. Distribution of this memo is unlimited.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2001). All Rights Reserved.

Abstract

This memo describes a proposed Management Information Base (MIB) for the PSTN/Internet Interworking (PINT) Services Architecture.

Table of Contents

	Introduction	
	The SNMP Management Framework	
3.	The need for PINT Services monitoring MIB	3
4.	PINT MIB Overview	4
5.	Definitions	5
6.	Acknowledgements	17
7.	Security Considerations	17
8.	IANA Considerations	18
9.	Intellectual Property	18
10.	References	18
	Authors' Addresses	
12.	Full Copyright Statement	21

1. Introduction

PINT services are an emerging set of new Internet based applications where voice (and fax) requests to the PSTN (Public Switched Telephone Network) are carried over the Internet. RFC 2458 [1] gives a good introduction to the (pre-standard) PINT architecture and services. It also has examples of some of the early implementations of pre-PINT.

This document defines a MIB which contains the elements for monitoring the performance of a PINT based service. The MIB consists of details of the four basic PINT services and their performance statistics measured under various criteria.

It is not the purpose of this MIB to enable management of the PINT networking elements. We are concerned only with the PINT specific performance parameters. While it is understood that PINT service performance is closely related to host and network performance, they are not addressed here.

2. The SNMP Management Framework

The SNMP Management Framework presently consists of five major components:

- o An overall architecture, described in RFC 2571 [2].
- o Mechanisms for describing and naming objects and events for the purpose of management. The first version of this Structure of Management Information (SMI) is called SMIv1 and described in STD 16, RFC 1155 [3], STD 16, RFC 1212 [4] and RFC 1215 [5]. The second version, called SMIv2, is described in STD 58, RFC 2578 [6], RFC 2579 [7] and RFC 2580 [8].
- o Message protocols for transferring management information. The first version of the SNMP message protocol is called SNMPv1 and described in STD 15, RFC 1157 [9]. A second version of the SNMP message protocol, which is not an Internet standards track protocol, is called SNMPv2c and described in RFC 1901 [10] and RFC 1906 [11]. The third version of the message protocol is called SNMPv3 and described in RFC 1906 [11], RFC 2572 [12] and RFC 2574 [13].
- Protocol operations for accessing management information. The first set of protocol operations and associated PDU formats is described in STD 15, RFC 1157 [9]. A second set of protocol operations and associated PDU formats is described in RFC 1905 [14].

A set of fundamental applications described in RFC 2573 [15] and the view-based access control mechanism described in RFC 2575

A more detailed introduction to the current SNMP Management Framework can be found in RFC 2570 [17].

Managed objects are accessed via a virtual information store, termed the Management Information Base or MIB. Objects in the MIB are defined using the mechanisms defined in the SMI.

This memo specifies a MIB module that is compliant to the SMIv2. MIB conforming to the SMIv1 can be produced through the appropriate translations. The resulting translated MIB must be semantically equivalent, except where objects or events are omitted because no translation is possible (use of Counter64). Some machine-readable information in SMIv2 will be converted into textual descriptions in SMIv1 during the translation process. However, this loss of machine readable information is not considered to change the semantics of the MTB.

3. The need for PINT services monitoring MIB

Traditionally voice (and fax) requests originate and terminate inside a PSTN network. This network is well known for robust handling of the requests, in terms of availability and security. However when the requests originate from the Internet there is a concern both on the part of the user as well as the provider about issues like reliable forwarding of the call requests to the PINT gateway under various network conditions, user/host authentication, secure handling of the user information etc. Performance and security management becomes all the more important where PINT services cross multiple administrative domains (or providers).

This MIB is an attempt to list the parameters that need to be monitored on an user, PINT client, PINT server and PINT gateway basis.

(PINT services, their invocation methods/protocols and security issues associated with the PINT architecture are discussed in detail in [18]).

4. PINT MIB - Overview

Following is a list of some explanations on the MIB definitions that we have chosen to construct.

- o The basic purpose of this MIB is to monitor the access to PINT services both from the performance and security point of view. Information may pertain to a certain user or his/her system (PINT client) or the system providing the PINT services (PINT server) or the PINT gateway that forwards the call to the PSTN network.
- We chose to build the configuration table as an extension of the Application MIB RFC 2287 [19] using the augments construct. Server location and contact might be retrieved from the standard MIB-II sysLocation and sysContact objects. There is no need to replicate this information in the PINT MIB. However, the PINT administrator may be a different person than the sysadmin with global responsibilities, thus a pintSysContact object is defined.
- o We chose to monitor the gateway connections from the PINT server. While the agent runs in the PINT servers, the connections to the gateways might need to be monitored in order to understand what goes on. We placed them in a separate MIB group, and by using MODULE-COMPLIANCE clauses, agents that cannot implement this stuff will not be mandated to do it.
- o There is no traps definition in this MIB module. Note that thresholding on counters is always possible by using a standard mechanism defined by the Remote Monitoring MIB, that can be referenced here. Some events that may be defined by using this mechanisms:
 - * continuous login/authentication failure or refusal from a particular client or user
 - * nuisance call repeated calls (within a specified period) to a number originating from the same user
- o The client performance and user performance tables may be rather resource demanding for an agent implementation. In some MIBs, like the Remote Monitoring (RMON) MIBs, control mechanisms were built in order to activate those statistics on demand. If needed, a sorting ('topN') mechanism can be designed, so that a sorted view of clients or users is presented for the high level debugging.

- o We built a time-distribution trying to cover both short-lived, as well as longer sessions (1-10 secs, 10 secs - 1 min., 1-15 min., 15 mins-24 hours, longer).
- o PintServerClientAddress is defined as a SnmpAdminString. It may include an IpAddress and/or name, but we preferred to minimize the number of indices at this stage, and keep a human-readable format at the same time.
- We define pintServerUserIdName as the UserId. This UserId needs to be unique across multiple PINT servers and gateways (depending on the architecture) and is mapped to the SessionId. One way to achieve this uniqueness is by appending clientId to the UserId string before sending to the PINT server. The SessionId could then be a combination of this new UserId and a timestamp.

5. Definitions

PINT-MIB DEFINITIONS ::= BEGIN

IMPORTS
 OBJECT-TYPE, Counter32, MODULE-IDENTITY, mib-2
FROM SNMPv2-SMI
TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
FROM SNMPv2-TC
MODULE-COMPLIANCE, OBJECT-GROUP
FROM SNMPv2-CONF
sysApplInstallPkgEntry
FROM SYSAPPL-MIB
SnmpAdminString
FROM SNMP-FRAMEWORK-MIB; -- RFC 2571 [2]

ORGANIZATION "IETF PINT Working Group"

CONTACT-INFO "
Chairs: Steve Bellovin

pintMib MODULE-IDENTITY

E-mail: smb@research.att.com

LAST-UPDATED "200102010000Z" -- 1 Feb 2001

Igor Faynberg

E-mail: faynberg@lucent.com

Authors: Murali Krishnaswamy

Postal: 20 Corporate Place South
Piscataway, NJ 08854
Tel: +1 (732)465-1000

```
E-mail: murali@photuris.com
                               Dan Romascanu
                               Postal: Atidim Technology Park, Bldg 3
                               Tel Aviv, Israel
                               Tel: +972 3 6458414
                               E-mail: dromasca@avaya.com
       General Discussion:pint@lists.bell-labs.com
       To Subscribe: pint-request@lists.bell-labs.com
       In Body: subscribe your-email-addres
       Archive: http://www.bell-labs.com/mailing-lists/pint/
DESCRIPTION
    "This MIB defines the objects necessary to monitor
    PINT Services"
-- Revision history
REVISION "200102010000Z" -- 1 Feb 2001
DESCRIPTION
   "Initial version, published as RFC 3055."
::= { mib-2 93 }
PintServiceType ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
       STATUS current
       DESCRIPTION
            "This TC describes the type of a PINT service."
       SYNTAX INTEGER {
               r2C(1),
                           -- Request-to-Talk
                          -- Request-to-Fax
               r2F(2),
               r2FB(3), -- Request-to-Fax-Back
               r2HC(4)
                           -- Request-to-Hear-Content
       }
PintPerfStatPeriod ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
STATUS
          current
DESCRIPTION
    "This TC describes the statistics period of time.
   Note that the values of the counters indexed with a value
   SinceReboot(4) can be potentially affected by a counter rollover.
   It is the responsibility of the application using this object to
   take into account that the counter has been zeroed each time it
   reached a value of (2**32-1)."
SYNTAX INTEGER {
last30sec(1), -- Performance Statics for the last 30 sec
```

```
last rebooted
}
-- pintServerConfig - PINT configuration MIB variables
pintReleaseNumber OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "An indication of version of the PINT protocol supported
    by this agent."
   ::= { pintServerConfig 1 }
pintSysContact OBULL SnmpAdminString
                      OBJECT-TYPE
   MAX-ACCESS read-write
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Contact information related to the administration of the PINT
    services."
   ::= { pintServerConfig 2 }
pintApplInstallPkgTable OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintApplInstallPkgEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Table describing the PINT applications that are installed."
   ::= { pintServerConfig 3 }
pintApplInstallPkgEntry OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX PintApplInstallPkgEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS
          current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Entries per PINT Application."
   AUGMENTS { sysApplInstallPkgEntry }
   ::= { pintApplInstallPkgTable 1 }
PintApplInstallPkgEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
```

```
pintApplInstallPkgDescription SnmpAdminString
pintApplInstallPkgDescription OBJECT-TYPE
            SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS
                current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Textual description of the installed PINT application."
    ::= { pintApplInstallPkgEntry 1 }
pintRegisteredGatewayTable OBJECT-TYPE
           SEQUENCE OF PintRegisteredGatewayEntry
    SYNTAX
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
              current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Table describing the registered gateway applications."
    ::= { pintServerConfig 4 }
pintRegisteredGatewayEntry OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX PintRegisteredGatewayEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Entries per Registered Gateway Application."
AUGMENTS { sysApplInstallPkgEntry }
    ::= { pintRegisteredGatewayTable 1 }
PintRegisteredGatewayEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
pintRegisteredGatewayName SnmpAdminString,
pintRegisteredGatewayDescription SnmpAdminString
pintRegisteredGatewayName OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
            current
   STITATIS
    DESCRIPTION
    "Name of the registered gateway."
    ::= { pintRegisteredGatewayEntry 1 }
pintRegisteredGatewayDescription OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
               current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Textual description of the registered gateway."
    ::= { pintRegisteredGatewayEntry 2 }
```

```
-- pintServerMonitor - PINT monitoring statistics MIB variables
pintServerGatewayPerf OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {pintServerMonitor 4 }
                             OBJECT-TYPE
pintServerGlobalStatsTable
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerGlobalStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Table displaying the monitored global server statistics."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalPerf 1 }
pintServerGlobalStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX PintServerGlobalStatsEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
              current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Entries in the global statistics table.
    One entry is defined for each monitored service type and
    performance statistics collection period."
    INDEX {pintServerServiceTypeIndex, pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex}
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsTable 1 }
PintServerGlobalStatsEntry
                             ::= SEQUENCE {
                                                  PintServiceType,
pintServerServiceTypeIndex
pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex
                                                  PintPerfStatPeriod,
pintServerGlobalCallsReceived
                                                  Counter32,
pintServerGlobalSuccessfulCalls
                                                  Counter32,
pintServerGlobalDisconnectedCalls
                                                  Counter32,
pintServerGlobalDisCUAutFCalls
                                                  Counter32,
pintServerGlobalDisServProbCalls
                                                  Counter32,
pintServerGlobalDisGatProbCalls
                                  Counter32
pintServerServiceTypeIndex OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX PintServiceType
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS
           current
    DESCRIPTION
    "The unique identifier of the monitored service."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 1 }
pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX PintPerfStatPeriod
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
```

```
STATUS
             current
    DESCRIPTION
     "Time period for which the performance statistics are requested
     from the pint server."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 2 }
pintServerGlobalCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Number of received global calls."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 3 }
pintServerGlobalSuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
              current
    DESCRIPTION
     "Number of global successful calls."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 4 }
pintServerGlobalDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
           current
   DESCRIPTION
     "Number of global disconnected (failed) calls."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 5 }
pintServerGlobalDisCUAutFCalls
OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX Counter32
MAX-ACCESS read-only
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "Number of global calls that were disconnected because of client
    or user authorization failure."
::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 6 }
pintServerGlobalDisServProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Number of global calls that were disconnected because of
    server problems."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 7 }
```

```
pintServerGlobalDisGatProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
            current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of global calls that were disconnected because of
    gateway problems."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 8 }
pintServerClientStatsTable
                              OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerClientStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
               current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Table displaying the monitored server client statistics."
    ::= { pintServerClientPerf 1 }
pintServerClientStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
           PintServerClientStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
               current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Entries in the client server statistics table.
    One entry is defined for each client identified by name,
    monitored service type and performance statistics collection
    period."
    INDEX {pintServerClientAddress, pintServerServiceTypeIndex,
   pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex}
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsTable 1 }
PintServerClientStatsEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
pintServerClientAddress
                                                    SnmpAdminString,
pintServerClientCallsReceived
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerClientSuccessfulCalls
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerClientDisconnectedCalls
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerClientDisCAutFCalls
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerClientDisEFProbCalls
                                                       Counter32
pintServerClientAddress OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
           current
   DESCRIPTION
    "The unique identifier of the monitored client
    identified by its address represented as as a string."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 1 }
```

```
pintServerClientCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
           current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received from the specific client."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 2 }
pintServerClientSuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the client successfully completed."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 3 }
pintServerClientDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received from the client, and that were
    disconnected (failed)."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 4 }
pintServerClientDisCAutFCalls
OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX Counter32
MAX-ACCESS read-only
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the client that were disconnected because of
    client authorization failure."
::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 5 }
pintServerClientDisEFProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
           current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the client that were disconnected because
    of egress facility problems."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 6 }
pintServerUserIdStatsTable
                          OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerUserIdStatsEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
     "Table displaying the monitored Pint service user statistics."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdPerf 1 }
pintServerUserIdStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX PintServerUserIdStatsEntry
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
     "Entries in the user statistics table.
     One entry is defined for each user identified by name,
     each monitored service type and performance statistics collection
     period.
      It is assumed that the capabilities of the pint server
      are enough to accommodate the number of entries in this table.
      It is a local server implementation issue if an aging mechanism
      Is implemented in order to avoid scalability problems."
    INDEX {pintServerUserIdName, pintServerServiceTypeIndex,
    pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex}
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsTable 1 }
                              ::= SEQUENCE {
PintServerUserIdStatsEntry
pintServerUserIdName
                                                       SnmpAdminString,
pintServerUserIdCallsReceived
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerUserIdSuccessfulCalls
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerUserIdDisconnectedCalls
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerUserIdDiscUIdAFailCalls
                                                       Counter32,
pintServerUserIdEFProbCalls
                                                       Counter32
pintServerUserIdName OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SnmpAdminString (SIZE(0..64))
    MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STITATIS
           current
    DESCRIPTION
     "The unique identifier of the monitored user
     identified by its name."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 1 }
pintServerUserIdCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
           current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received from the specific user."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 2 }
```

```
pintServerUserIdSuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
            current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the user successfully completed."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 3 }
pintServerUserIdDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received from the user that were
    disconnected (failed)."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 4 }
pintServerUserIdDiscUIdAFailCalls
OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX Counter32
MAX-ACCESS read-only
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the user that were disconnected because of
    user authorization failure."
::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 5 }
pintServerUserIdEFProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS
           current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the user that were disconnected because of
    egress facility problems."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 6 }
pintServerGatewayStatsTable OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerGatewayStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
          current
    DESCRIPTION
    "Table displaying the monitored gateway statistics."
    ::= { pintServerGatewayPerf 1 }
pintServerGatewayStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX PintServerGatewayStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
     "Entries in the gateway table.
    One entry is defined for each gateway identified by name,
    each monitored service type and performance statistics collection
    INDEX { pintRegisteredGatewayName, pintServerServiceTypeIndex,
   pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex }
    ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsTable 1 }
PintServerGatewayStatsEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
pintServerGatewayCallsReceived
                                               Counter32,
pintServerGatewaySuccessfulCalls
                                               Counter32,
pintServerGatewayDisconnectedCalls
                                               Counter32
pintServerGatewayCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received at the specified gateway."
    ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsEntry 1 }
pintServerGatewaySuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS
           current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls successfully completed at the specified gateway."
    ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsEntry 2 }
pintServerGatewayDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls that were disconnected (failed) at the specified
    gateway."
    ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsEntry 3 }
-- Notifications Section
-- (none defined)
-- Conformance Section
```

```
pintMibCompliances OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { pintMibConformance 1 }
                   OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { pintMibConformance 2 }
pintMibGroups
pintMibCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "Describes the requirements for conformance to the
    PINT MIB."
MODULE -- this module
MANDATORY-GROUPS { pintMibConfigGroup, pintMibMonitorGroup }
::= { pintMibCompliances 1 }
pintMibConfigGroup OBJECT-GROUP
OBJECTS {
pintReleaseNumber,
pintSysContact,
pintApplInstallPkgDescription,
pintRegisteredGatewayName,
pintRegisteredGatewayDescription
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "A collection of objects providing configuration
    information
    for a PINT Server."
::= { pintMibGroups 1 }
pintMibMonitorGroup OBJECT-GROUP
OBJECTS {
pintServerGlobalCallsReceived,
pintServerGlobalSuccessfulCalls,
pintServerGlobalDisconnectedCalls,
pintServerGlobalDisCUAutFCalls,
pintServerGlobalDisServProbCalls,
pintServerGlobalDisGatProbCalls,
pintServerClientCallsReceived,
pintServerClientSuccessfulCalls,
pintServerClientDisconnectedCalls,
pintServerClientDisCAutFCalls,
pintServerClientDisEFProbCalls,
--pintServerUserIdName,
pintServerUserIdCallsReceived,
pintServerUserIdSuccessfulCalls,
pintServerUserIdDisconnectedCalls,
pintServerUserIdDiscUIdAFailCalls,
pintServerUserIdEFProbCalls,
```

```
pintServerGatewayCallsReceived,
pintServerGatewaySuccessfulCalls,
pintServerGatewayDisconnectedCalls
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "A collection of objects providing monitoring
    information
    for a PINT Server."
::= { pintMibGroups 2 }
```

END

6. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Igor Faynberg for his encouragement to produce this work.

7. Security Considerations

There is only one management object defined in this MIB that has a MAX-ACCESS clause of read-write (pintSysContact). There are no read-create objects. This read-write object may be considered sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments. The support for SET operations in a non-secure environment without proper protection can have a negative effect on network operations.

There are a number of managed objects in this MIB that may contain information that may be sensitive from a business perspective. One could be the customer identification (UserIdName). Also information on PINT services performance might itself be need to be guarded. It is thus important to control even GET access to these objects and possibly to even encrypt the values of these object when sending them over the network via SNMP. Not all versions of SNMP provide features for such a secure environment.

 ${\tt SNMPv1}$ by itself is not a secure environment. Even if the network itself is secure (for example by using IPSec), even then, there is no control as to who on the secure network is allowed to access and GET/SET (read/change/create/delete) the objects in this MIB.

It is recommended that the implementers consider the security features as provided by the SNMPv3 framework. Specifically, the use of the User-based Security Model RFC 2574 [13] and the View-based Access Control Model RFC 2575 [16] is recommended.

It is then a customer/user responsibility to ensure that the SNMP entity giving access to an instance of this MIB, is properly configured to give access to the objects only to those principals (users) that have legitimate rights to indeed GET or SET (change/create/delete) them.

8. IANA Considerations

All extensions to the values listed in this MIB must be done through Standards Action processes as defined in RFC 2434 [20].

9. Intellectual Property

The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any intellectual property or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; neither does it represent that it has made any effort to identify any such rights. Information on the IETF's procedures with respect to rights in standards-track and standards-related documentation can be found in BCP-11. Copies of claims of rights made available for publication and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementors or users of this specification can be obtained from the IETF Secretariat.

The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights which may cover technology that may be required to practice this standard. Please address the information to the IETF Executive Director.

10. References

- [1] Lu, H., Conroy, L., Bellovin, S., Krishnaswamy, M., Burg, F., DeSimone, A., Tewani, K., Davidson, P., Schulzrinne, H. and K. Vishwanathan, "Toward the PSTN/Internet Inter-Networking --Pre-PINT Implementations", RFC 2458, November 1998.
- [2] Wijnen, B., Harrington, D. and R. Presuhn, "An Architecture for Describing SNMP Management Frameworks", RFC 2571, April 1999.
- [3] Rose, M. and K. McCloghrie, "Structure and Identification of Management Information for TCP/IP-based Internets", STD 16, RFC 1155, May 1990.

- [4] Rose, M. and K. McCloghrie, "Concise MIB Definitions", STD 16, RFC 1212, March 1991.
- [5] Rose, M., "A Convention for Defining Traps for use with the SNMP", RFC 1215, March 1991.
- [6] McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D. and J. Schoenwaelder, "Structure of Management Information Version 2 (SMIv2)", STD 58, RFC 2578, April 1999.
- [7] McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D. and J. Schoenwaelder, "Textual Conventions for SMIv2", STD 58, RFC 2579, April 1999.
- [8] McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D. and J. Schoenwaelder, "Conformance Statements for SMIv2", STD 58, RFC 2580, April 1999.
- [9] Case, J., Fedor, M., Schoffstall, M. and J. Davin, "Simple Network Management Protocol", STD 15, RFC 1157, May 1990.
- [10] Case, J., McCloghrie, K., Rose, M. and S. Waldbusser,
 "Introduction to Community-based SNMPv2", RFC 1901, January
 1996.
- [11] Case, J., McCloghrie, K., Rose, M. and S. Waldbusser, "Transport Mappings for Version 2 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv2)", RFC 1906, January 1996.
- [12] Case, J., Harrington D., Presuhn R. and B. Wijnen, "Message Processing and Dispatching for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", RFC 2572, April 1999.
- [13] Blumenthal, U. and B. Wijnen, "User-based Security Model (USM) for version 3 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv3)", RFC 2574, April 1999.
- [14] Case, J., McCloghrie, K., Rose, M. and Waldbusser, "Protocol Operations for Version 2 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv2)", RFC 1905, January 1996.
- [15] Levi, D., Meyer, P. and B. Stewart, "SNMPv3 Applications", RFC
 2573, April 1999.
- [16] Wijnen, B., Presuhn, R. and K. McCloghrie, "View-based Access Control Model (VACM) for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", RFC 2575, April 1999.

- [17] Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D. and B. Stewart, "Introduction to Version 3 of the Internet-standard Network Management Framework", RFC 2570, April 1999.
- [18] Petrack, S. and L. Conroy, "The PINT Service Protocol: Extensions to SIP and SDP for IP Access to Telephone Call Services", RFC 2848, June 2000.
- [19] Krupczak, C. and J. Saperia, "Definitions of System-Level Managed Objects for Applications", RFC 2287, February 1998.
- [20] Narten, T. and H. Alvestrand, "Guidelines for Writing an IANA Considerations Section in RFCs", BCP 26, RFC 2434, October 1998.

11. Authors' Addresses

Murali Krishnaswamy Lucent Technologies 3C-512, 101 Crawfords Corner Rd. Holmdel, NJ 07733

Phone: +1 (732)949-3611 Fax: +1 (732)949-3210EMail: murali@lucent.com

Dan Romascanu Avaya Communication Atidim Technology Park, Bldg 3 Tel Aviv, Israel

Phone: +972 3 6458414 EMail: dromasca@avaya.com

12. Full Copyright Statement

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2001). All Rights Reserved.

This document and translations of it may be copied and furnished to others, and derivative works that comment on or otherwise explain it or assist in its implementation may be prepared, copied, published and distributed, in whole or in part, without restriction of any kind, provided that the above copyright notice and this paragraph are included on all such copies and derivative works. However, this document itself may not be modified in any way, such as by removing the copyright notice or references to the Internet Society or other Internet organizations, except as needed for the purpose of developing Internet standards in which case the procedures for copyrights defined in the Internet Standards process must be followed, or as required to translate it into languages other than English.

The limited permissions granted above are perpetual and will not be revoked by the Internet Society or its successors or assigns.

This document and the information contained herein is provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE INTERNET SOCIETY AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIMS ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

Acknowledgement

Funding for the RFC Editor function is currently provided by the Internet Society.